OF GREG ROCKROHR

ENERGY ENGINEERING PROGRAM SAFETY AND RELIABILITY DIVISION ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION

Ameren Transmission Company of Illinois Docket No. 12-0598 (Robinette Portion of Rehearing)

Petition for a Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity, pursuant to Section 8-406.1 of the Illinois Public Utilities Act, and an Order pursuant to Section 8-503 of the Public Utilities Act, to Construct, Operate and Maintain a New High Voltage Electric Service Line and Related Facilities in the Counties of Adams, Brown, Cass, Champaign, Christian, Clark, Coles, Edgar, Fulton, Macon, Montgomery, Morgan, Moultrie, Pike, Sangamon, Schuyler, Scott and Shelby, Illinois.

December 10, 2013

1 <u>Introduction</u>

- 2 Q. Please state your name and business address.
- 3 A. My name is Greg Rockrohr. My business address is 527 East Capitol Avenue,
- 4 Springfield, Illinois 62701.
- 5 Q. Are you the same Greg Rockrohr who previously provided direct testimony
- 6 in this docket?
- 7 A. Yes. My prepared direct testimony, Staff Ex. 1.0, was initially filed on March 29,
- 8 2013, with an errata and revision filed on April 10, 2013. I testified at the
- 9 evidentiary hearing on May 13, 2013.
- 10 Q. What is the purpose of your direct testimony in this rehearing?
- 11 A. My direct testimony offers my recommendation regarding an alternative route
- proposal from Mr. Andrew Robinette and Ms. Stacy Robinette ("Robinettes").
- 13 Robinettes' Alternative Route Proposal
- 14 Q. What is your recommendation regarding the Robinettes' alternative route?
- 15 A. If, following rehearing, the Commission determines that ATXI's Alternative Route
- between Meredosia and Pawnee should be used, then I recommend that the
- 17 Commission also determine that the Robinettes' alternative route, which modifies
- a portion of ATXI's Alternate Route, also should be used.
- 19 Q. What is the Robinettes' alternative route proposal?
- 20 A. The Robinettes' alternative route, filed on February 13, 2013, would modify a
- 21 portion of ATXI's alternate route between Meredosia and Pawnee, in Section 21

22		of Centerville Precinct Township, in Morgan County.' The relevant portion of	
23		ATX	s Alternate Route is depicted on ATXI Ex. 4.2, Part 39, Page 2. ATXI's
24		Alter	nate Route, without Robinettes' modification, runs south along Delong Rd.
25		betw	een Pitchford Rd. and Nortonville Rd. At Nortonville Rd., ATXI's Alternate
26		Rout	e turns east. The Robinettes' alternative route would eliminate the spans of
27		the t	transmission line along Delong Rd. that are south of Pitchford Rd., and
28		inste	ad turn the transmission line to the southeast at the corner of Delong Rd.
29		and	Pitchford Rd. until the line reaches Nortonville Rd. At Nortonville Rd. the
30		Robinettes' alternative route would turn east and rejoin ATXI's Alternate Route.	
31	Q.	Have you attempted to use the criteria that the Commission identified in its	
32		Aug	ust 20, 2013, Final Order to compare the Robinettes' alternative route to
33		ATX	l's Alternate Route?
34	A.	Yes, It is my understanding that, in its Final Order, the Commission utilized the	
35		following eleven criteria to evaluate each route alternative presented:	
36		a.	Length of Line
37		b.	Difficulty and Cost of Construction
38		C.	Difficulty and Cost of Operation and Maintenance
39		d.	Environmental Impacts
40		e.	Impacts on Historical Resources
41		f.	Social and Land Use Impacts
42		g.	Number of Affected Landowners and other Stakeholders and Proximity to
43			Homes and other Structures

¹ Attachment A to Robinettes' February 13, 2013, alternative route proposal; and ATXI Ex. 13.5 (Rev.).

- h. Proximity to Existing and Planned Development
- i. Community Acceptance
- 46 j. Visual Impact
- 47 k. Presence of Existing Corridors
- 48 Q. What do you conclude regarding (a): Length of Line?
- 49 A. Robinettes' alternative route is about 0.4 miles shorter than ATXI's Alternate 50 Route.
- 51 Q. What do you conclude regarding (b): Difficulty and Cost of Construction?
- 52 A. There would be no appreciable difference in difficulty or cost of construction.

 53 Based upon ATXI's anticipated span lengths, the Robinettes' alternative route

 54 would likely require three fewer structures.² But the difficulty and cost savings

 55 due to fewer structures for the Robinettes' alternative route would likely be offset

 56 by the added cost of one additional dead-end structure and somewhat more

 57 difficult/costly access to the structure locations.
- 58 Q. What do you conclude regarding (c): Difficulty and Cost of Operation and
 59 Maintenance?
- A. There would be no appreciable difference in the difficulty and cost of operations and maintenance. Periodic tree trimming would be necessary along both routes. It appears that fewer trees would need to be trimmed/removed along the shorter Robinettes' alternative route, and fewer facilities would need to be maintained, but again, these savings would likely be offset by somewhat more difficult/costly access.

3

² ATXI Ex. 7.0, 3.

- 66 Q. What do you conclude regarding (d): Environmental Impacts and (e)
 67 Impacts on Historical Resources?
- 68 A. I am unaware of significant impacts regarding either criterion for either route.
- 69 Q. What do you conclude regarding (f): Social and Land Use Impacts?
- 70 A. Other than residences, the land use in this area appears to be agricultural. I note 71 that Delong Rd. is very narrow, so that if ATXI's Alternate Route is used without 72 the Robinettes' alternative, many of ATXI's support structures along Delong Rd. 73 will likely be located in areas that are now cultivated. Though the Robinettes' 74 alternative route passes diagonally across cultivated land, it appears to me that, with careful support structure placement, few, if any, of ATXI's support structures 75 76 would need to be placed in cultivated areas. Conductors would pass over the top 77 of cultivated areas, but it appears to me that the support structures and their foundations could be placed to avoid areas where farming equipment regularly 78 79 travels.
- 80 Q. What do you conclude regarding (g): Number of Affected Landowners and other Stakeholders and Proximity to Homes and other Structures?
- A. The primary benefit of the Robinettes' alternative route is that it would move the 345 kV transmission line substantially farther away from two residences located along Delong Rd. In particular, ATXI's Alternate Route appears to pass very near the residence at 248 Delong Rd., which is located on the east side of Delong Rd., south of Pitchford Rd.
- 87 Q. What do you conclude regarding (h): Proximity to Existing and Planned
 88 Development?

- As stated above, the use of Robinettes' alternative route would move the 345 kV transmission line farther away from two existing residences on Delong Rd. I am unaware of any additional existing or planned development along either route.
- 92 Q. What do you conclude regarding (i): Community Acceptance and (j): Visual93 Impact.
- A. The Robinettes' alternative route would move the line farther from a narrow county road (Delong Rd.) to a less visible location, while also moving it farther from a somewhat-wider Nortonville Rd. Since the Robinettes' alternative route would result in less visual impact, it is likely that the Robinettes' alternative route would have greater community acceptance.
- 99 Q. What do you conclude regarding (k): Presence of Existing Corridors?
- The only existing corridor of which I am aware is the county road rights-of-way associated with ATXI's Alternate Route. However, due to the existence of residences along the narrow Delong Rd. right-of-way, I do not view this county road corridor as providing ATXI's Alternate Route an advantage.
- 104 Q. What is your recommendation regarding the Robinettes' alternative route?
- As expressed in Staff's prior testimony and briefs, Staff is not convinced that

 ATXI's Alternate Route, with or without the Robinettes' recommended

 modification, is the least cost route between Meredosia and Pawnee.³ However,

 if, in its Final Order in this rehearing, the Commission approves use of the ATXI

 Alternate Route between Meredosia and Pawnee, the Commission should also

³ Staff Ex. 1.0, 34-37; Staff BOE, 5-10.

adopt the relatively minor modification to ATXI's Alternate Route that the Robinettes propose.